

**Remarks**

Claims 1 and 7-20 are pending and are under consideration.

There are no allowed claims.

Claims 1 and 7-20 are rejected under 35 USC 102(e) as being anticipated by Chin, et al., U.S. Pat. No. 6,444,754.

Applicants respectfully rebut these rejections.

Chin discloses polymer compositions comprising polyphenylene ether or polystyrene blended with polyamides or polyesters. A compatibilizer prepared in the presence of a glycidyl functionalized nitroxyl initiator is employed.

The Examiner points to Example 3 of Chin where compound (101) therein is employed to prepare a glycidyl functionalized polystyrene.

The Examiner states on page 3 of the Action that for example when present "X" is alkyl-CH-aryl (*sic*) that this encompasses Chin's species.

Applicants point out that this is not possible. Present "aryl" is defined in claim 1 as:

"the aryl groups are phenyl or naphthyl which are unsubstituted or substituted with C<sub>1</sub>-C<sub>12</sub>alkyl, halogen, C<sub>1</sub>-C<sub>12</sub>alkoxy, C<sub>1</sub>-C<sub>12</sub>alkylcarbonyl, OH, -COOH or -COO(C<sub>1</sub>-C<sub>12</sub>)alkyl"

Glycidyloxy is not present as a possible substituent on aryl. Therefore there is no possible overlap of the present claims with any disclosure of Chin.

Applicants submit that the 35 USC 102(e) rejections are addressed and are overcome.

The Examiner is kindly requested to reconsider and to withdraw the present rejections.

Applicants submit that the present claims are in condition for allowance and respectfully request that they be found allowable.

Respectfully submitted,



Ciba Specialty Chemicals Corp.  
540 White Plains Road  
P.O. Box 2005  
Tarrytown, NY 10591-9005  
Tel. (914)785-2783  
Fax (914)785-7102

Tyler A. Stevenson  
Agent for Applicants  
Reg. No. 46,388